Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

Should ELISA testing be mandatory?

One claim, evidence, reasoning response built from your debate worksheet: the side you argued, your three strongest arguments, the opposing point you answered, and where you stand now.

John Carroll runs the first 40 minutes. The week 1 facilitator is not named yet.

Use your period and code, not your name.

Period and code

Date

The side I was handed

Route: paper handed in, or one PDF

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

The 80 minute block

0 to 5 minutes, John Carroll. Launch. Scenario read together; sides assigned.

5 to 22 minutes, John Carroll. Facilitated debate. Argue your assigned side with the evidence you prepared. Every claim needs a reason someone else could check.

22 to 33 minutes, John Carroll. Rebuttals. Answer the other side's strongest point, not its weakest.

33 to 40 minutes, John Carroll. Close the debate. Write where you now stand and what moved you.

40 to 50 minutes, Mr. Mendoza. Write the CER. Turn your worksheet into one CER: J1 claim, J2 evidence with sources, J3 reasoning with the error that matters most and one ELISA limit, J4 the point you answered, J5 where you stand. Hand it in.

50 to 80 minutes, Mr. Mendoza. PLTW work for your unit. Pick up the unit work named for your section on this page. This is not part of the debate and not part of the CER.

Scenario, the first argument on each side, the question and the icebreaker are the only JCU text permitted on a public page (permission recorded 2026-08-11). The second and third arguments on each side and the preparation background stay in class.

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

Know by the end

A new infectious disease called Novel Flu Syndrome spreads with a high rate of asymptomatic carriers, but causes severe complications in some people, including long-term organ damage. A fast, cheap ELISA test detects antibodies to NFS, which tells you about past or current infection.

The case for: Mandatory testing finds infected people, including asymptomatic carriers, so isolation, contact tracing and targeted intervention can stop the spread.

The case against: Mandatory testing overrides the right to privacy and to bodily autonomy. The choice to be tested should belong to the person.

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

J1. Side and claim

Write the claim your assigned side defends, in one sentence, as an answer to the question: Should ELISA testing for Novel Flu Syndrome be mandatory?

Space: 2 writing lines. The claim is your side's answer, not yet your own view. Your own view goes in J5.

What you can draw on: Assigned side; Case question

Side argued:

Claim sentence:

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

J2. Evidence

List your three strongest arguments for the claim. Next to each one, name where it comes from: the scenario, your preparation assignment, or a public source you can name.

Space: Three numbered entries, 2 writing lines each. A preference is not evidence. If you cannot name where an argument comes from, it is not ready.

What you can draw on: Scenario (Know by the end); Preparation assignment; Named public source

Argument 1 and source:

Argument 2 and source:

Argument 3 and source:

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

J3. Reasoning

Explain how your evidence supports the claim. Name which test error matters more here, a false positive or a false negative, and who carries that harm. State one limit of an antibody test in your own words.

Space: 4 writing lines. A false positive is a person who has not been infected and gets a positive result. A false negative is a person who has been infected and gets a negative result. Both are wrong, and they do not land on the same person.

An antibody test reports your immune response, not the germ itself. Antibodies take days to weeks to appear, so a person infected this week can still test negative while they are spreading NFS. A positive result can also mark an infection that is already over.

Finding who is infectious right now takes a test for the germ, not a test for antibodies. Naming that gap is a strong argument on either side, and it is worth saying out loud in the room.

No error rate is supplied for this test, so do not invent one.

What you can draw on: The two test errors and the antibody limit, both written under this part; Your preparation assignment, if you have it; Science ceilings 1 to 6

Reasoning:

Error that matters more and who bears it:

One ELISA limit:

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

J4. Opposing point and answer

Write the other side's strongest point from the debate, then your direct answer to it.

Space: 3 writing lines. Restating your own point is not an answer. Take on their best case, not their weakest.

What you can draw on: Debate rebuttal round

Their strongest point:

Your answer:

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

J5. Where I stand now

Write where you actually stand now and what moved you. This may differ from the side you argued.

Space: 3 writing lines. Name one condition that would flip your view. If nothing would, you are asserting, not arguing.

What you can draw on: Debate close

My position now:

What moved me:

Your CER record

PBS Case A - Period 1-2 - 2026-09-24

Before you hand it in

Read your CER once as a stranger would

- [ ] You can argue a position you were assigned rather than one you chose.
- [ ] You can state the strongest argument against your own side and answer it.
- [ ] You can separate what the evidence shows from what you believe about it.
- [ ] You handed in one CER once, with a source named on every piece of evidence: on paper to Mr. Mendoza at the end of the block, or as one PDF to your own section's assignment if you were absent or took the report route.

Hand your CER (J1 to J5) to Mr. Mendoza at the end of the block. If you were absent or took the report route, submit one PDF to your own section's assignment, Wk5 CER: JCU bioethics 1, should ELISA testing be mandatory? by the due date on the assignment. Put your period and code on the page. Do not submit twice.

This debate is not a PLTW activity and does not count toward myPLTW completion. Do not mark any online activity complete unless you completed it.

Wk5 CER: JCU bioethics 1, should ELISA testing be mandatory?

https://clevelandmetro.schoology.com/assignment/8552705109

Today's portal lesson

https://mendozabiomed.org/learn/pltw-pbt/day/2026-09-24